JAHES EMMIN OLERA

04 MAR 16 PM 1:00

1 2

3

4 5

> 6 7

8

10

11

12 13

14 15

17

18

16

19 20

22

23

21

2425

26

ORDER

Page - 1 -

UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT
WESTERN DISTRICT OF WASHINGTON
AT SEATTLE

IN RE: PHENYLPROPANOLAMINE (PPA) PRODUCTS LIABILITY LITIGATION,

This document relates to the actions listed on Attachment A

MDL NO. 1407

SUGGESTION OF REMAND ORDER

C-1-01-164

The Court, having reviewed the records of the cases listed on Attachment A, and having heard argument of counsel, finds and rules as follows:

- (1) Common discovery and other coordinated pretrial proceedings have been completed. All remaining issues are case-specific, and best determined by the transferor courts.
- (2) These cases will not benefit from further coordinated proceedings as part of MDL 1407, and are ready to be remanded to their respective transferor courts.

For these reasons, pursuant to Rule 7.6 of the Rules of Procedure of the Judicial Panel on Multidistrict Litigation, the Court issues its Suggestion of Remand Order in the cases listed on Attachment A. The Clerk is ORDERED to provide copies of this Order to the Clerk of the Judicial Panel on Multidistrict Litigation and to the clerks of the transferor district courts listed

on Appendix A. DATED at Seattle, Washington this 12th day of March, 2004. s/ Barbara Jacobs Rothstein BARBARA JACOBS ROTHSTEIN UNITED STATES DISTRICT JUDGE

ORDER Page - 2 -

APPENDIX A

WD WA Cause #	Case	Transferor Court/ Cause #		
02-cv-538	Rhonda Bailey v. Schering- Plough Healthcare Prod- ucts, Inc.	Western Dist. of Kentucky, No. 01-213		
02-cv-29	Eleanor D. Beattie, et al. v. Novartis Consumer Health, Inc.	Middle Dist. of Louisiana (Baton Rouge), No. 01-1025		
01-cv-2026	Londell Bell v. Bayer Corp., et al.	Western Dist. of Louisiana (Shreve- port), No. 01-2018		
01-cv-2137	Sharon Carter v. Bayer Corp.	Eastern Dist. of Kentucky(Covington), No. 01-199		
02-cv-373	Lynette Fisk, et al. v. Novartis AG, et al.	Dist. of Utah (Cen- tral), No. 01-985		
02-cv-1863	Daniel S. Goettsch v. Smithkline Beecham Con- sumer Healthcare, et al.	Dist. of Minnesota, No. 02-1268		
01-cv-2227	Nina Hastings, et al. v. Novartis Corp.	Eastern Dist. of Texas (Sherman), No. 01-338		
02-cv-1272	Gerald Jones, et al. v. Perrigo Co., et al.	Western Dist. of Kentucky (Bowling Green), No. 01-182		
01-cv-1406	Stacey Kerrigan, et al. v. Whitehall-Robins, et al.	Dist. of Massachu- setts, No. 01-10325		
02-cv-420	Rose Lynn Kobar v. Novartis Corp., et al.	Dist. of Arizona (Phoenix), No. 01- 156		
02-cv-1020	Stephanie Lambert, et al. v. Bayer Corp., et al.	Western Dist. of Louisiana (Shreve- port), No. 02-363		
02-cv-21	Ronald Lewis, et al. v. Glaxosmithkline PLC, et al.	Dist. of Connecticut (New Haven), No. 01-2093		

ORDER

Page - 3 -

1 2 3		03-cv-2093	Barbara Ann Lupo v. Novartis Pharm. Corp., et al.	Southern Dist. of Mississippi (East- ern), severed from No. 01-169
4		02-cv-918	Bernadette Massey, et al. v. Sandoz Pharm. Corp., et al.	Southern Dist. of Texas (Houston), No. 01-3795
6		01-cv-2167	Lurline McKinney, et al. v. Bayer Corp., et al.	Western Dist. of Louisiana (Shreve- port), No. 01-2219
7 8		03-cv-1390	Sandra Mustoe, et al. v. Bayer Corp., et al.	Northern Dist. of California, No. 01-4181
9		02-cv-278	Charles Newman, et al. v. American Home Products, et al.	Dist. of Nevada, No. 01-1345
11 12		02-cv-364	Lynne Nill, et al. v. Perrigo Sales Corp., et al.	Southern Dist. of Ohio (Cincinatti), No. 01-755
-	ii l			
13 14		02-cv-1168	Tracy Patton v. Novartis Consumer Health, Inc.	Southern Dist. of Indiana (New Albany Div.), No. 02-47
		02-cv-1168 01-cv-2164		Indiana (New Albany
14 15			Consumer Health, Inc. Elvira S. Quarrels, et al.	Indiana (New Albany Div.), No. 02-47 Western Dist. of Louisiana (Monroe),
14 15 16 17		01-cv-2164	Consumer Health, Inc. Elvira S. Quarrels, et al. v. Bayer Corp. Sharon Roberts-Weisner, et al. v. Whitehall-Robins	Indiana (New Albany Div.), No. 02-47 Western Dist. of Louisiana (Monroe), No. 01-2195 Dist. of Colorado
14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22		01-cv-2164 02-cv-904	Consumer Health, Inc. Elvira S. Quarrels, et al. v. Bayer Corp. Sharon Roberts-Weisner, et al. v. Whitehall-Robins Healthcare, et al. Perry Robinson, et al. v.	Indiana (New Albany Div.), No. 02-47 Western Dist. of Louisiana (Monroe), No. 01-2195 Dist. of Colorado (Denver), No. 02-240 Western Dist. of Louisiana (Shreve-port),
14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21		01-cv-2164 02-cv-904 01-cv-2166	Consumer Health, Inc. Elvira S. Quarrels, et al. v. Bayer Corp. Sharon Roberts-Weisner, et al. v. Whitehall-Robins Healthcare, et al. Perry Robinson, et al. v. Bayer Corp., et al. Dennis Romero, et al. v.	Indiana (New Albany Div.), No. 02-47 Western Dist. of Louisiana (Monroe), No. 01-2195 Dist. of Colorado (Denver), No. 02-240 Western Dist. of Louisiana (Shreve-port), No. 01-2217 Western Dist. of Louisiana (Lafayette),

ORDER Page - 4 -

26

1	0	1
2		
3	С	1
4		
5	С	1
6		
7		1
8		_
9		
10		
11		
12		
13		
14		
15		
16		
17		
18		
19		
20		
21		
22		
23		
24		

01-cv-1656	Bettye Lou Taylor, et al. v. Bayer Corp., et al.	Northern Dist. of Texas (Lubbock), No. 01-166
01-cv-2182	John Tutwiler, et al. v. Novartis Consumer Health	Southern Dist. of Ohio (Dayton), No. 01-447
01-cv-2100	Nathaniel Williams v. GlaxoSmithKline, PLC et al.	Western Dist. of Louisiana (Shreve- port), No. 01-1981
01-cv-1405	Alexander P. Ziolkowski v. Novartis Consumer Health, Inc., et al.	Dist. of Massachu- setts, No. 01-10324

ORDER Page - 5 -

25

26